Negative: Venezuela TPS

By Katherine Baker

***Resolved: The United States federal government should substantially reduce its restrictions on legal immigration to the United States.***

Summary: The ongoing political, economic and human rights crisis in Venezuela motivates the introduction of a bill in Congress to grant TPS (Temporary Protected Status) to Venezuelans in the U.S. TPS allows nationals of the protected country to stay even if their visas have expired or even if they are here illegally, for a specific duration of time, to allow them refuge from the crisis afflicting their homeland. This has been done in the past with other countries like Haiti, Liberia and El Salvador due to natural disasters or wars. TPS recipients can stay, live and work in the US without fear of deportation until TPS time period expires. The Negative view is that TPS will never expire. t has proven immensely difficult to ever end a TPS program once it gets started. TPS keeps getting extended indefinitely long after the original crisis is over, because the people here “temporarily” while “fleeing an emergency” discover that they really don’t want to go home when the emergency is over. It becomes simply another avenue of expanding immigration in general under the guise of never-ending or phony emergencies. In addition, those truly fleeing for their lives can flee to neighboring countries where the US is sponsoring refugee camps and donating massive amounts of foreign aid. Venezuelans truly at risk don’t have to flee to the US a thousand miles away when the nearest point of safety is in walking distance just across the border.  
 This brief offers 2 alternative theories, which obviously contradict each other, but they give alternative reasons to vote Negative no matter which one the Judge believes. In one case, things in Venezuela are bad, so we shouldn’t grant TPS because it will allow opponents of the regime to escape to the US and they won’t foment the revolution Venezuela desperately needs. The misery will be prolonged forever with an AFF ballot. In the other case, Venezuela is doing fine, there is no humanitarian crisis, so there is no need for TPS at all. If there are any economic problems in Venezuela, they’re caused by economic sanctions, and a simple Minor Repair could lift those and solve easily.

Negative: Venezuela TPS 3

INHERENCY 3

1. US Supporting Refugees in neighboring countries. 3

Supporting Refugees in neighboring countries 3

Over $100 million to help neighboring countries 3

US aid is building long-term regional capacity to handle > 3 million refugees from Venezuela 3

2. Crisis will end soon 3

Maduro will be forced to negotiating table – he is weakening by the day 3

Opponents galvanized under one man 4

Maduro isolated 4

Clear contrast to Syria increases likelihood of Maduro leaving 4

Economics likely fatal to Maduro 4

MINOR REPAIR – Cancel economic sanctions 5

Any economic problems Venezuela has are caused by US sanctions 5

Sanctions are the real cause of any economic problems in Venezuela and should be abolished 5

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE 5

1. No failed state, no civil war 5

Venezuela is not falling apart, there is no civil war and no chaos 5

Maduro is well-supported because he has accomplished a lot of good things – the US media just doesn’t report it 6

2. No humanitarian crisis 6

Venezuelans are getting along fine, they’re well-fed 6

Health care in Venezuela is far better than it was 10 years ago 6

3. No economic collapse 7

Prices are stabilizing, commodities are available 7

DISADVANTAGES 7

1. Prolongs the misery in Venezuela 7

Link: Emigration delays Venezuela crisis resolution 7

Admitting Venezuelans to the US creates a safety valve for Maduro, prolongs the crisis by allowing them to avoid reform 7

Link: TPS would remove pressure on Maduro. Opponents of the regime leave, so regime change won’t happen 8

Link& Brink: the longer Maduro stays in power, the worse things will get 8

Link: Maduro sends economy into freefall 8

Impact: Maduro makes economic problems worse for the poort 8

Impact: Economy deteriorates, will fail when the oil money runs out 9

2. Endangers migrants 9

TPS leads to more migration, which puts migrants in danger 9

3. Worsening Immigration Crisis 9

Link: Already coming in in droves 9

Link: Worsening immigration crisis 9

Impact: Threat to National Security – increases risk from terrorists and criminals 10

4. Unvetted permanent refugees 10

Link: Not temporary: no end in sight 10

Link: TPS allows illegal aliens to stay indefinitely. 10

Link: TPS extended long after need 10

Link: No verifying return 11

Link: Nothing More Permanent than a temporary alien. 11

Link: TSP grants nearly irrevocable 11

Link: Even when US seeks to end TPS, it still can’t 11

Brink: TPS must be reformed before we consider using it again on Venezuela 12

Impact: Lower wages 12

Impact: hurts low-skilled American workers, blacks and Hispanics suffer the most 12

Impact: Wealthy make money, poor lose it. 12

Impact: $50 billion/year social cost 13

5. Masking Disad. 13

Admitting refugees masks the problem - distracts us from solving the root cause of the instability 13

6. Mindset Kritik 13

Hyping the exaggerated claims of “crisis” leads to promoting/justifying US intervention. Impact is bloodshed in Venezuela 13

Hyping the “crisis” is simply a pretext for military intervention 13

Works Cited 14

Negative: Venezuela TPS

INHERENCY

1. US Supporting Refugees in neighboring countries.

Supporting Refugees in neighboring countries

Tim Henderson, 2018. (covers demographics for Stateline, a news branch of Pew Charitable Trust) “Venezuelan Immigrants Get Trump Sympathy but Not Status” October 2, 2018. <https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2018/10/02/venezuelan-immigrants-get-trump-sympathy-but-not-status?amp=1>

“There really hasn’t been a coordinated response,” said Andrew Selee, president of the Migration Policy Institute. “It came up so suddenly that it wasn’t really on the political radar until recently.” The Trump administration has provided about $100 million to house refugees in countries neighboring Venezuela, he added.

Over $100 million to help neighboring countries

Carmen Sesin, 2019. (Reporter for NBC News) “Pence hits Venezuela with new sanctions, promises 'even stronger' measures ahead” Feb. 25, 2019. <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/latino/colombia-vice-president-pence-announce-clear-actions-against-venezuela-s-n975621>

Pence also said the U.S. is sending another $56 million to Venezuela's neighbors to help them cope with the influx of migrants from Venezuela. Over 3 million Venezuelans have fled their country's turmoil in recent years. The U.S. has already provided $139 million to the neighboring countries.

US aid is building long-term regional capacity to handle > 3 million refugees from Venezuela

USAID, 2019. (United States Agency for International Development. The Government program responsible for Aid.) “UNITED STATES IS READY TO PROVIDE URGENT HUMANITARIAN AID TO THE PEOPLE OF VENEZUELA” January 24, 2019. <https://www.usaid.gov/news-information/press-releases/jan-24-2019-united-states-ready-provide-urgent-humanitarian-aid-people-venezuela>

The United States also continues to provide robust support for response efforts throughout the region as the growing impacts of Maduro's crisis spill into neighboring countries. Since Fiscal Year 2017, the United States has provided more than $140 million in humanitarian and development assistance to support affected countries' emergency efforts and build their long-term capacity to host the more than three million people who have fled repression and chaos in Venezuela since 2014.

1. Crisis will end soon

Maduro will be forced to negotiating table – he is weakening by the day

Gladys McCormick, 2019. (Contributor for US News and World Report). “What the U.S. Can Do to Help Venezuela” Feb. 6, 2019. <https://www.usnews.com/news/best-countries/articles/2019-02-06/commentary-what-the-us-can-do-to-help-venezuela>

Rather than using what is taking place in Venezuela as a proxy for larger geopolitical conflicts, we should urge the Trump administration to practice a policy of restraint, working toward getting Marudo and Guaidó to the negotiating table to arrive at a solution that de-escalates the conflict instead of taking on another costly, long-term intervention (Syria, Afghanistan, Iraq) or a short, ill-conceived one (Libya, Honduras). Maduro's position is weakening by the day, especially as sectors of the military, which have long supported him, are starting to peel off. Without their backing, Maduro may be pushed to the negotiating table sooner rather than later.

Opponents galvanized under one man

The Economist, 2019. (The Economist is a weekly newspaper from London.) “How to hasten the demise of Venezuela’s dictatorship” Jan 24th 2019. <https://www.economist.com/leaders/2019/01/24/how-to-hasten-the-demise-of-venezuelas-dictatorship>

Suddenly Mr Maduro’s demoralised, divided opponents have been galvanised (see article). Tens of thousands of people across the country demonstrated against the regime on January 23rd, the 61st anniversary of the overthrow of Venezuela’s previous dictatorship. Among them were many poor Venezuelans. They have not lightly turned against a regime founded in 1999 by their hero, the late Hugo Chávez. Before a cheering crowd in Caracas, the capital, Mr Guaidó proclaimed himself the acting president—a role the constitution gives him when the presidency is vacant. In what looked like a co-ordinated move, President Donald Trump immediately recognised Mr Guaidó as Venezuela’s interim leader and most of the Lima group quickly followed.

Maduro isolated

Tom Phillips, 2019. (Tom Phillips is the Guardian's Latin America correspondent) “Venezuela's neighbours turn up heat as Nicolás Maduro begins second term” 9 Jan 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/jan/09/venezuela-nicolas-maduro-second-term-neighbours-latin-america>

But most Latin American countries are moving in the opposite direction, leaving Maduro increasingly friendless in a region his Bolivarian predecessor, Hugo Chávez, dreamed of uniting during the “pink tide” era of leftist rule. Brazil, in particular, looks poised to play a frontline role in the diplomatic push to force Venezuela’s president out. “In the early days of the administration, my understanding is that people in the Bolsonaro government want to send a very clear and unequivocal signal that Maduro’s costs in the region are about to go up,” said Spektor.

Clear contrast to Syria increases likelihood of Maduro leaving

Ethan Bronner, 2019. (Bronner is the Senior Editor for Bloomberg News) “Venezuela's Maduro Is Doomed? They Said That About Syria's Assad” February 10, 2019. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-02-10/venezuela-s-maduro-is-doomed-they-said-that-about-syria-s-assad>

Unlike Syria, the Venezuelan state relies for income almost exclusively on oil sales, especially to the U.S., and Washington’s recently announced boycott could prove crippling. Second, the loyalty of the security establishment in Syria is based on membership in the Alawite minority of the Assad family, whereas in Venezuela it’s more transactional; peeling away top generals in Caracas will prove easier.

Economics likely fatal to Maduro

Ethan Bronner, 2019. (Bronner is the Senior Editor for Bloomberg News) “Venezuela's Maduro Is Doomed? They Said That About Syria's Assad” February 10, 2019. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-02-10/venezuela-s-maduro-is-doomed-they-said-that-about-syria-s-assad>

Dany Bahar, a Venezuelan political scientist at the Brookings Institution in Washington, said the economics of Venezuela will likely prove fatal to Maduro. “He can’t stabilize the economy, it’s going to get worse and worse,” Bahar said. “Half a million barrels of oil exported to the U.S. is the only cash-generating exports he has.”

MINOR REPAIR – Cancel economic sanctions

Any economic problems Venezuela has are caused by US sanctions

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America“ <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

This is not to minimize Venezuela’s problems. The country was hit, like other oil-producing countries, and as it was in the 1980s and ’90s, by the collapse of oil prices. That failed to bring down the government, so now the Trump administration has created an artificial crisis by using [extreme economic warfare](https://fair.org/home/us-media-ignore-and-applaud-economic-war-on-venezuela/) to deprive the country of foreign exchange needed to import basic necessities.  The Trump measures seem designed to [prevent any economic recovery](https://www.thenation.com/article/trumps-sanctions-make-economic-recovery-in-venezuela-nearly-impossible/). Like any country at war (and the Trump administration has placed Venezuela under wartime conditions, and is threatening immediate invasion), there have been shortages, and products that can mostly be found on the black market. This should surprise no one: During World War II in the US, a cornucopia of a country not seriously threatened with invasion, there was strict rationing of products like sugar, coffee and rubber.

Sanctions are the real cause of any economic problems in Venezuela and should be abolished

Alison Bodine 2018 (Coordinator of “Fire This Time Venezuela Solidarity Campaign”) 17 Oct 2018 “Why is the CBC Lying About Venezuela? Anna Maria Tremonti Manufactures Dissent” (brackets added) <https://venezuelanalysis.com/analysis/14101>

If brevity was your concern, then a short quote from the former Prime Minister of Spain, Jose Luis Zapatero would have sufficed, "I must say that the intensification of the growth in emigration these past months has much to do with the economic sanctions imposed by the U.S. and that has been supported by some governments.”  Or, as Alfred de Zayas, Independent Expert on the promotion of a democratic and equitable international order from the United Nations reported, “The effects of sanctions imposed by Presidents Obama and Trump and unilateral measures by Canada and the European Union have directly and indirectly aggravated the shortages in medicines such as insulin and anti-retroviral drugs. To the extent that economic sanctions have caused delays in distribution and thus contributed to many deaths, sanctions contravene the human rights obligations of the countries imposing them.”.

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE

1. No failed state, no civil war

Venezuela is not falling apart, there is no civil war and no chaos

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America” <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

The campaign of disinformation and outright lies about Venezuela was kicked off in 2016 by the Financial Times. Ironically, it chose the 14th anniversary of the 2002 failed coup d’etat against President Hugo Chávez—April 11, 2016—to [claim](https://www.ft.com/content/697f928a-fa77-11e5-8f41-df5bda8beb40) that Venezuela was in “chaos” and “civil war,” and that Venezuela was a “failed state.” As with the Time and CNBC reports, the Financial Times reporter was not in Venezuela, and there was no evidence in the report that he had ever been there. I asked right-wing friends in Venezuela whether they agreed with the Financial Times claims. “Well, no, of course not,” said one, stating the obvious, “there is no chaos and no civil war. But Venezuela is a failed state, since it has not been able to provide for all the medical needs of the population.” By that standard, every country in Latin America is a failed state, and obviously the [United States too](https://www.patheos.com/blogs/dispatches/2018/10/15/study-45000-deaths-per-year-due-to-lack-of-health-insurance/).

Maduro is well-supported because he has accomplished a lot of good things – the US media just doesn’t report it

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America” <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

Meanwhile, the government is inaugurating a new high-speed train line, *The Dream of Hugo Chávez*, in March (**Correo del Orinoco**, [2/6/19](http://www.correodelorinoco.gob.ve/primer-tramo-del-sistema-ferroviario-ezequiel-zamora-ii-entrara-en-funcionamiento-en-marzo/)). Since the US media have never allowed reporting on any accomplishments in the years since  Chávez took office in 1999, but only any alleged, exaggerated or, as noted, completely invented shortcomings, readers have to consult an alternative history. Here is one offered by a Venezuelan on **YouTube** ([3/31/11](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lq6464raaJ4)): “Por Culpa de Chávez” (“It’s Chávez’s Fault”). Depicting new hospitals, transit lines, housing, factories and so on built under Chavismo, it might help many understand why the Maduro government continues to enjoy such strong backing from so many people.

2. No humanitarian crisis

Venezuelans are getting along fine, they’re well-fed

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America” <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

Hard as it may be for followers of the US media to believe, Venezuela is a country where people play sports, go to work, go to classes, go to the beach, go to restaurants and attend concerts. They publish and read newspapers of all political stripes, from right to center-right, to center, to center-left, to left. They produce and watch programs on television, on TV channels that are also of all political stripes. CNN was ridiculed recently (Redacted Tonight, [2/1/19](https://youtu.be/BLkzE8-tQyk)) when it carried a report on Venezuela, “in the socialist utopia that now leaves virtually every stomach empty,” followed immediately with a cut to a demonstration by the right-wing opposition, where everybody appeared to be quite well-fed. But surely that’s because most of the anti-government demonstrators were upper-middle class, a viewer might think. The proletarians at pro-government demonstrations must be suffering severe hunger. Not if one consults [photos](https://www.telesurtv.net/multimedia/fotos-venezuela-caracas-marcha-revolucion-bolivariana-20190202-0029.html) of the massive pro-government demonstration on February 2, where people seemed to be doing pretty well.

Health care in Venezuela is far better than it was 10 years ago

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America” <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

Well, OK, but are the reports of conditions in Venezuelan hospitals true or grossly exaggerated? “They are much better than they were ten years ago,” said a friend who works in a Caracas hospital. In fact, he said, ten years before, the hospital where he worked did not exist, and new hospitals are now being opened. One was dedicated recently in the town of El Furrial, and another was opened in El Vigia, as reported by the centrist newspaper Últimas Noticias ([3/3/17](http://www.ultimasnoticias.com.ve/noticias/slider/maduro-inaugura-hospital-furrial-estado-monagas/), [4/27/18](http://www.ultimasnoticias.com.ve/noticias/sin-categoria/fueron-aprobados-43-billones-bolivares-hospital-vigia/)).  The government has also greatly expanded others, like a [burn center in Caracas](http://www.ultimasnoticias.com.ve/noticias/comunidad/reinaugurada-unidad-quemados-hospital-militar-caracas/) and [three new operating rooms](http://www.ultimasnoticias.com.ve/noticias/comunidad/salud/El-Aissami-reinaugura-quirofanos-de-hospital-de-Vi/) at the hospital in Villa Cura.

3. No economic collapse

Prices are stabilizing, commodities are available

Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America” <https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/>

The Venezuelan government has made food, medicine and pharmaceuticals available at extremely low prices, but much of the merchandise has made its way to the black market, or over the border to Colombia, depriving Venezuelans of supplies and ruining Colombian producers. The government recently abandoned some of the heavy price subsidies, which resulted initially in higher prices. Over the past few weeks, prices have been coming down as supplies stayed in Venezuela, especially as the government gained greater control over the Colombian border to prevent smuggling.

DISADVANTAGES

1. Prolongs the misery in Venezuela

Link: Emigration delays Venezuela crisis resolution

Federation for American Immigration Reform, 2019. (non-profit that advocates for immigration reform). “The Pros And Cons Of TPS For Venezuelans” February 27, 2019. <https://immigrationreform.com/2019/02/27/the-pros-and-cons-of-tps-for-venezuelans/>

Third, while the granting of TPS to Venezuelans seems humane and legitimate given the conditions in the country, it may also ultimately harm the Bolivarian Republic by delaying the restoration of freedom and democracy. In fact, if thousands (or perhaps tens of thousands) of Venezuelans leave the country, this will likely ease some of the popular pressure on the despotic neo-communist Maduro regime. After all, corrupt leaders throughout Latin America have been using mass emigration as a safety valve to defuse social discontent and maintain their power and wealth.

Admitting Venezuelans to the US creates a safety valve for Maduro, prolongs the crisis by allowing them to avoid reform

Monica Showalter 2019 (M.S. from Columbia University’s Graduate School of Journalism) AMERICAN THINKER 25 Feb 2019 “Kamala Harris's solution to Venezuela crisis bombs with Venezuelans “ [https://www.americanthinker.com/blog/2019/02/kamala\_harriss\_twitter\_solution\_to\_venezuela\_crisis\_bombs\_with\_venezuelans.html#ixzz5kSfpPPjw](https://www.americanthinker.com/blog/2019/02/kamala_harriss_twitter_solution_to_venezuela_crisis_bombs_with_venezuelans.html#ixzz5kSfpPPjw(brackets) (brackets added)

Worse still, she [Sen. Kamala Harris] seems to think the whole valiant Venezuelan effort to take their country back, and the necessary U.S. role to support them alongside the rest of Latin America as they seek to free their country from the death grip of socialism, is really about just more access to green cards here. As I [tweeted myself](https://twitter.com/mmshowalter1/status/1099490622686121984) to the woman, her solution to the crisis is a safety valve for Maduro.  She seems to think that is the best solution, not a restoration of democracy done by Venezuelans, given that Central Americans have been using that for years to avoid any reform of their socialist countries.  Just have Uncle Sugar take the discontented ones, and the Venezuelan socialism can carry on as normal.  That seems to be her plan.

Link: TPS would remove pressure on Maduro. Opponents of the regime leave, so regime change won’t happen

David North 2019 (Fellow of the Center for Immigration Studies; conducted two studies for the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation on what happens to foreign-born students in science and engineering when they attend American graduate schools. He also conducted a year-long evaluation of the impact of the 1986 Immigration Reform and Control Act for the Ford Foundation; former Assistant for Farm Labor to the U.S. Secretary of Labor, and executive director of Pres. Lyndon Johnson’s Cabinet Committee on Mexican-American Affairs ) 8 Mar 2019 “Another Reason to Not Grant TPS to Venezuelans”   
<https://cis.org/North/Another-Reason-Not-Grant-TPS-Venezuelans>

My colleague Dan Cadman wrote recently on why the United States [should not grant Temporary Protected Status](https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela) (TPS) to those in the U.S. from Venezuela. While both of us recognize the hardships Venezuela's people are suffering, and hail them for voting with their feet against the incompetent dictatorship in that country, TPS is not, as Cadman points out, good for this country. But let's step back and look at the regional history for a moment, and think about another factor. Let's look at Cuba, a staunch ally of Maduro, and what happened when we opened our doors — more or less — to the Cuban refugees. Although it was useful for the individual departing Cubans, the revolutionary energy needed to overthrow Castro soon settled down in Miami, taking pressure off the regime in Havana and keeping it off for decades. It is perhaps hard-hearted to think along these lines, but successful revolutions are rarely pulled off by people who are not there.

Link& Brink: the longer Maduro stays in power, the worse things will get

Kenneth Rapoza, 2019. (Senior Contributor for Forbes News. He spent 20 years as a reporter for the best in the business, including as a Brazil-based staffer for WSJ.) “What If Venezuela's Leader Nicolas Maduro Does Not Step Down?” Feb 1, 2019. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/kenrapoza/2019/02/01/what-if-venezuelas-leader-nicolas-maduro-does-not-step-down/#356fb3a65b93>

It’s now a game of Survivor to see if the Maduro regime can outwit, outlast and outplay the opposition, and survive the intensity of the economic shocks yet to come. The WSJ reported this week that PdVSA has only 10 days left of gasoline supply remaining. Venezuela’s crisis isn't stagnating or improving. It’s about to get worse.

Link: Maduro sends economy into freefall

BBC News, 2019. (UK-based independent news source.) “Venezuela crisis: How the political situation escalated” 24 January 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-36319877>

Nicolás Maduro was first elected in April 2013 after the death of his socialist mentor and predecessor in office, Hugo Chávez. At the time, he won by a thin margin of 1.6 percentage points. During his first term in office, the economy went into freefall and many Venezuelans blame him and his socialist government for the country's decline.

Impact: Maduro makes economic problems worse for the poort

BBC News, 2019. (UK-based independent news source.) “Venezuela crisis: How the political situation escalated” 24 January 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-36319877>

Some of the problems go back a long time. However, it is President Maduro and his predecessor, the late President Hugo Chávez, who find themselves the target of much of the current anger. Their socialist governments have been in power since 1999, taking over the country at a time when Venezuela had huge inequality. But the socialist polices brought in which aimed to help the poor backfired. Take price controls, for example. They were introduced by President Chávez to make basic goods more affordable to the poor by capping the price of flour, cooking oil and toiletries. But this meant that the few Venezuelan businesses producing these items no longer found it profitable to make them.

Impact: Economy deteriorates, will fail when the oil money runs out

Note: PSUV is Maduro’s political party.

Kenneth Rapoza, 2019. (Senior Contributor for Forbes News.) “What If Venezuela's Leader Nicolas Maduro Does Not Step Down?” Feb 1, 2019. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/kenrapoza/2019/02/01/what-if-venezuelas-leader-nicolas-maduro-does-not-step-down/#356fb3a65b93>

The third option is the worst option for Venezuela, but the best for PSUV: Maduro and PSUV dig in their heels and maintain their grip on power. Washington does not intervene out of concern that it would be a bad look for them and even endanger the opposition in Venezuela, including Guaido. The economy remains sanctioned and deteriorates further under this option. Venezuela becomes a more closed system, waiting for the day when PdVSA oil money runs out.

1. Endangers migrants

TPS leads to more migration, which puts migrants in danger

Federation for American Immigration Reform 2019. (Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR), a non-profit that advocates for immigration reform). “The Pros And Cons Of TPS For Venezuelans” February 27, 2019. <https://immigrationreform.com/2019/02/27/the-pros-and-cons-of-tps-for-venezuelans/>

Furthermore, granting TPS to Venezuelan citizens will likely spur mass migration from that country to the United States. Most would probably undertake the long land route northwest across the entire length of Central America and Mexico. This poses a hazard to the potential migrants themselves.

1. Worsening Immigration Crisis

Link: Already coming in in droves

Tim Henderson, 2018. (demographics for Stateline, a news branch of Pew Charitable Trust.) “Venezuelan Immigrants Get Trump Sympathy but Not Status” October 2, 2018. <https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2018/10/02/venezuelan-immigrants-get-trump-sympathy-but-not-status?amp=1>

Venezuelans have been flooding into the United States as their home country faces a severe economic and political crisis. Immigration from Venezuela increased by 21 percent or almost 61,000 people between 2016 and 2017, the largest significant increase in immigrants from one country that year, according to the Migration Policy Institute, a nonpartisan think tank based in Washington, D.C. Florida, Texas, California, New Jersey and Georgia got the lion’s share of new Venezuelans, and earlier waves of Venezuelan immigrants are organizing to help them. Nationally the Venezuelan immigrant population has nearly doubled since 2010 to more than 350,000, according to census figures.

Link: Worsening immigration crisis

Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad. Within the immigration law enforcement field, Mr. Cadman's knowledge and experience encompass, among other things, criminal aliens, employer sanctions, and national security and terrorism matters.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. <https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela>

Finally we must consider that there is already a crisis on the southern border. The facts and figures make this clear, whatever liberals and progressives and alien advocacy groups may say. Granting TPS would only add to the already out-of-control situation when Venezuelans to decide to join the tens of thousands of Central Americans already headed north. What's more, it might encourage others in the region, such as Nicaraguans (whose own country teeters on economic and social instability — see here and here) to do likewise in hopes that their physical presence would encourage a similar grant of TPS.

Impact: Threat to National Security – increases risk from terrorists and criminals

Dr. Kirk Johnson and Dr. Tim Kane, 2006. (Tim Kane, Ph.D., is Bradley Fellow in Labor Policy and Kirk A. Johnson, Ph.D., is a Senior Policy Analyst in the Center for Data Analysis at The Heritage Foundation.) “The Real Problem with Immigration... and the Real Solution” March 1, 2006. <https://www.heritage.org/immigration/report/the-real-problem-immigration-and-the-real-solution>

Typical illegal aliens come to America primarily for better jobs and in the process add value to the U.S. economy. However, they also take away value by weakening the legal and national security environment. When three out of every 100 people in America are undocumented (or, rather, documented with forged and faked papers), there is a profound security problem. Even though they pose no direct security threat, the presence of millions of undocumented migrants distorts the law, distracts resources, and effectively creates a cover for terrorists and criminals.

1. Unvetted permanent refugees

Link: Not temporary: no end in sight

Tim Henderson, 2018. (covers demographics for Stateline, a news branch of Pew Charitable Trust.) “Venezuelan Immigrants Get Trump Sympathy but Not Status” October 2, 2018. <https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2018/10/02/venezuelan-immigrants-get-trump-sympathy-but-not-status?amp=1>

Venezuela is in “a downward spiral with no end in sight,” the United Nations said in a June report. A mismanaged state-controlled economy has made food and health care unavailable to many people, and dissidents have been jailed and tortured.

Link: TPS allows illegal aliens to stay indefinitely.

FAIR, 2016. (The Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR) is a non-profit tax exempt organization in the United States that self-identifies as an organization seeking to reduce both legal and illegal immigration.) “Temporary Protected Status” January 2016. <http://fairus.org/issue/legal-immigration/temporary-protected-status>

Clearly the test of whether the TPS program would work as intended, i.e., a temporary respite for persons who fear returning home because of temporary adverse conditions, is whether TPS status has been allowed to lapse when homeland conditions have stabilized and whether the protected populations have then left the United States to return home. By this standard, TPS has been an absolute failure. Practice has shown a pattern of unjustified extensions of TPS designations and demands for amnesty by the protected aliens so that they could stay permanently in the United States.

Link: TPS extended long after need

FAIR, 2016. (The Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR) is a non-profit tax exempt organization in the United States that self-identifies as an organization seeking to reduce both legal and illegal immigration.) “Temporary Protected Status” January 2016. <http://fairus.org/issue/legal-immigration/temporary-protected-status>

For nearly as long, TPS status for Central Americans from Nicaragua and Honduras — again mostly illegal aliens — has been extended beyond any rational humanitarian need. They received that provisional status in January 1999, and have had the status periodically renewed despite the end of emergency conditions in their homelands.

Link: No verifying return

FAIR, 2016. (The Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR) is a non-profit tax exempt organization in the United States that self-identifies as an organization seeking to reduce both legal and illegal immigration.) “Temporary Protected Status” January 2016. <http://fairus.org/issue/legal-immigration/temporary-protected-status>

Even in instances where TPS has ended without being converted to DED status or an amnesty, that has not mean that the individuals who benefitted from that designation came under any pressure to leave the United States to return to their homeland. There is no evidence that the immigration authorities have ever used the information provided by the aliens when they registered for TPS to verify whether those no longer legally in the country have left following the lapse of TPS. Whether the immigration authorities have been under instruction to ignore the illegal residence of former TPS beneficiaries or have simply not seen them as a priority, the results have conveyed the message that there is no hurry in departing — if ever.

Link: Nothing More Permanent than a temporary alien.

Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. <https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela>

First is that past grants of TPS to nationals of various countries have been outrageously abused, resulting in years and years — in fact, decades — of extensions by administrations of both parties, belying the "temporary" nature of the relief. As CIS Executive Director Mark Krikorian has remarked, there is nothing more permanent than a temporary alien.

Link: TSP grants nearly irrevocable

Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. <https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela>

The bottom line message is clear: Any grant of TPS, once made, becomes nearly irrevocable and results not only in resistance to termination when the program logically should end — which is to say, when the natural or man-made disaster that led to the grant in the first place is over — but increasing demands to grant another privileged group the right to remain forever. Given this ground truth, it is almost certain that the administration will find ways to support the Venezuelan people short of granting TPS.

Link: Even when US seeks to end TPS, it still can’t

Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. <https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela>

First is that past grants of TPS to nationals of various countries have been outrageously abused, resulting in years and years — in fact, decades — of extensions by administrations of both parties, belying the "temporary" nature of the relief. As CIS Executive Director Mark Krikorian has remarked, there is nothing more permanent than a temporary alien. Second is that when this administration, recognizing the abuse, moved to end TPS for several nationalities, and did so in a generous way by phasing the programs out over the course of 12 to 18 months, it was promptly sued by litigants who cherry-picked the jurisdictions where they would file, to ensure favorable treatment by liberal progressive judges. Sure enough, a national injunction ensued, forcing the administration to perpetuate the programs while the cases wind their way through the appeals process.

Brink: TPS must be reformed before we consider using it again on Venezuela

Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. <https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela>

So what's the answer? TPS is sorely in need of reform. Some good bills have been introduced into past sessions of Congress that would amend the abuses that make the program so suspect and singularly unattractive. If either Soto or Menendez were to couple a grant of TPS for Venezuelans with honest language that adopted some of the best provisions in past bills, perhaps there would be room for compromise on the matter.

Impact: Lower wages

Prof. GEORGE J. BORJAS, 2016. (professor of economics and social policy at the Harvard Kennedy School of Govt.) “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers” September/October 2016. <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216>

This second message might be hard for many Americans to process, but anyone who tells you that immigration doesn’t have any negative effects doesn’t understand how it really works. When the supply of workers goes up, the price that firms have to pay to hire workers goes down. Wage trends over the past half-century suggest that a 10 percent increase in the number of workers with a particular set of skills probably lowers the wage of that group by at least 3 percent. Even after the economy has fully adjusted, those skill groups that received the most immigrants will still offer lower pay relative to those that received fewer immigrants.

Impact: hurts low-skilled American workers, blacks and Hispanics suffer the most

Prof. GEORGE J. BORJAS, 2016. (professor of economics and social policy at the Harvard Kennedy School of Govt.) “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers” September/October 2016. <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216>

Both low- and high-skilled natives are affected by the influx of immigrants. But because a disproportionate percentage of immigrants have few skills, it is low-skilled American workers, including many blacks and Hispanics, who have suffered most from this wage dip. The monetary loss is sizable. The typical high school dropout earns about $25,000 annually. According to census data, immigrants admitted in the past two decades lacking a high school diploma have increased the size of the low-skilled workforce by roughly 25 percent. As a result, the earnings of this particularly vulnerable group dropped by between $800 and $1,500 each year.

Impact: Wealthy make money, poor lose it.

Prof. GEORGE J. BORJAS, 2016. (professor of economics and social policy at the Harvard Kennedy School of Govt.) “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers” September/October 2016. <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216>

But that’s only one side of the story. Somebody’s lower wage is always somebody else’s higher profit. In this case, immigration redistributes wealth from those who compete with immigrants to those who use immigrants—from the employee to the employer. And the additional profits are so large that the economic pie accruing to all natives actually grows. I estimate the current “immigration surplus”—the net increase in the total wealth of the native population—to be about$50 billion annually. But behind that calculation is a much larger shift from one group of Americans to another: The total wealth redistribution from the native losers to the native winners is enormous, roughly a half-trillion dollars a year. Immigrants, too, gain substantially; their total earnings far exceed what their income would have been had they not migrated.

Impact: $50 billion/year social cost

GEORGE J. BORJAS, 2016. (George J. Borjas is professor of economics and social policy at the Harvard Kennedy School and author of the forthcoming We Wanted Workers: Unraveling the Immigration Narrative.) “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers” September/October 2016. <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216>

When we look at the overall value of immigration, there’s one more complicating factor: Immigrants receive government assistance at higher rates than natives. The higher cost of all the services provided to immigrants and the lower taxes they pay (because they have lower earnings) inevitably implies that on a year-to-year basis immigration creates a fiscal hole of at least $50 billion—a burden that falls on the native population.

5. Masking Disad.

Admitting refugees masks the problem - distracts us from solving the root cause of the instability

James Carafano, Steven Bucci, David Inserra, 2015. (Carafano - leading expert in national security and foreign policy challenges, The Heritage Foundation’s vice president for foreign and defense policy studies. Bucci - served America for three decades as an Army Special Forces officer and top Pentagon official, visiting research fellow at The Heritage Foundation. Inserra - specializes in cyber and homeland security policy, including protection of critical infrastructure, as policy analyst at Heritage Foundation.) 17 Nov 2015. “What a Responsible Syrian Refugee Policy Looks Like for US After Paris Attacks” <http://dailysignal.com/2015/11/17/what-a-responsible-syrian-refugee-policy-looks-like-for-u-s-after-paris-attacks/>

Conversely, what we should not do is believe that simply taking refugees is a solution to the problem. Refugee programs are an emergency measure to protect those “persecuted or have a credible fear of persecution based on their religion, race, political beliefs, or membership in a social group.” They are not a substitute for a policy that deals with the source of instability.

6. Mindset Kritik

Hyping the exaggerated claims of “crisis” leads to promoting/justifying US intervention. Impact is bloodshed in Venezuela

Alison Bodine 2018 (Coordinator of “Fire This Time Venezuela Solidarity Campaign”) 17 Oct 2018 “Why is the CBC Lying About Venezuela? Anna Maria Tremonti Manufactures Dissent” (brackets added) <https://venezuelanalysis.com/analysis/14101>

Without a shred of critical thinking, Tremonti let [US Ambassador to the UN, Nikki] Haley take over the airwaves with the threatening statement, “The world in general needs to realize that we have a dictator in Venezuela that is doing everything to protect himself and sacrificing all of the Venezuelan people to do it. At some point, Maduro is going to have to be dealt with.” This certainly sounds like Tremonti, and the CBC is drumming for war and invasion against Venezuela. When Haley says “dealt with” there is no question that she means the U.S. President Donald Trump’s “all options are on the table when it comes to Venezuela” kind of dealt with; the kind of “dealt with” that means bloodshed in Venezuela.

Hyping the “crisis” is simply a pretext for military intervention

Alison Bodine 2018 (Coordinator of “Fire This Time Venezuela Solidarity Campaign”) 17 Oct 2018 “Why is the CBC Lying About Venezuela? Anna Maria Tremonti Manufactures Dissent” <https://venezuelanalysis.com/analysis/14101>

How about playing the words of Alfred de Zayas? “A disquieting media campaign seeks to force observers into a preconceived view that there is a ‘humanitarian crisis’ in the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela. An independent expert must be wary of hyperbole, bearing in mind that ‘humanitarian crisis’ is a terminus technicus that can be misused as a pretext for military intervention…”

Works Cited

1. Tim Henderson, 2018. (covers demographics for Stateline, a news branch of Pew Charitable Trust) “Venezuelan Immigrants Get Trump Sympathy but Not Status” October 2, 2018. https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2018/10/02/venezuelan-immigrants-get-trump-sympathy-but-not-status?amp=1
2. Carmen Sesin, 2019. (Reporter for NBC News) “Pence hits Venezuela with new sanctions, promises 'even stronger' measures ahead” Feb. 25, 2019. https://www.nbcnews.com/news/latino/colombia-vice-president-pence-announce-clear-actions-against-venezuela-s-n975621
3. USAID, 2019. (United States Agency for International Development. The Government program responsible for Aid.) “UNITED STATES IS READY TO PROVIDE URGENT HUMANITARIAN AID TO THE PEOPLE OF VENEZUELA” January 24, 2019. https://www.usaid.gov/news-information/press-releases/jan-24-2019-united-states-ready-provide-urgent-humanitarian-aid-people-venezuela
4. Gladys McCormick, 2019. (Contributor for US News and World Report). “What the U.S. Can Do to Help Venezuela” Feb. 6, 2019. https://www.usnews.com/news/best-countries/articles/2019-02-06/commentary-what-the-us-can-do-to-help-venezuela
5. The Economist, 2019. (The Economist is a weekly newspaper from London.) “How to hasten the demise of Venezuela’s dictatorship” Jan 24th 2019. https://www.economist.com/leaders/2019/01/24/how-to-hasten-the-demise-of-venezuelas-dictatorship
6. Tom Phillips, 2019. (Tom Phillips is the Guardian's Latin America correspondent) “Venezuela's neighbours turn up heat as Nicolás Maduro begins second term” 9 Jan 2019. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/jan/09/venezuela-nicolas-maduro-second-term-neighbours-latin-america
7. Ethan Bronner, 2019. (Bronner is the Senior Editor for Bloomberg News) “Venezuela's Maduro Is Doomed? They Said That About Syria's Assad” February 10, 2019. https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-02-10/venezuela-s-maduro-is-doomed-they-said-that-about-syria-s-assad
8. Mark Cook 2019 (American journalist; resident of Caracas, Venezuela) 22 Feb 2019 “Venezuela Coverage Takes Us Back to Golden Age of Lying About Latin America" https://fair.org/home/venezuela-coverage-takes-us-back-to-golden-age-of-lying-about-latin-america/
9. Alison Bodine 2018 (Coordinator of “Fire This Time Venezuela Solidarity Campaign”) 17 Oct 2018 “Why is the CBC Lying About Venezuela? Anna Maria Tremonti Manufactures Dissent” https://venezuelanalysis.com/analysis/14101
10. Federation for American Immigration Reform, 2019. (non-profit that advocates for immigration reform). “The Pros And Cons Of TPS For Venezuelans” February 27, 2019. https://immigrationreform.com/2019/02/27/the-pros-and-cons-of-tps-for-venezuelans/
11. Monica Showalter 2019 (M.S. from Columbia University’s Graduate School of Journalism) AMERICAN THINKER 25 Feb 2019 “Kamala Harris's solution to Venezuela crisis bombs with Venezuelans “ https://www.americanthinker.com/blog/2019/02/kamala\_harriss\_twitter\_solution\_to\_venezuela\_crisis\_bombs\_with\_venezuelans.html#ixzz5kSfpPPjw
12. David North 2019 (Fellow of the Center for Immigration Studies; conducted two studies for the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation on what happens to foreign-born students in science and engineering when they attend American graduate schools. He also conducted a year-long evaluation of the impact of the 1986 Immigration Reform and Control Act for the Ford Foundation; former Assistant for Farm Labor to the U.S. Secretary of Labor, and executive director of Pres. Lyndon Johnson’s Cabinet Committee on Mexican-American Affairs ) 8 Mar 2019 “Another Reason to Not Grant TPS to Venezuelans” https://cis.org/North/Another-Reason-Not-Grant-TPS-Venezuelans
13. Kenneth Rapoza, 2019. (Senior Contributor for Forbes News. He spent 20 years as a reporter for the best in the business, including as a Brazil-based staffer for WSJ.) “What If Venezuela's Leader Nicolas Maduro Does Not Step Down?” Feb 1, 2019. https://www.forbes.com/sites/kenrapoza/2019/02/01/what-if-venezuelas-leader-nicolas-maduro-does-not-step-down/#356fb3a65b93
14. BBC News, 2019. (UK-based independent news source.) “Venezuela crisis: How the political situation escalated” 24 January 2019. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-36319877
15. Federation for American Immigration Reform 2019. (Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR), a non-profit that advocates for immigration reform). “The Pros And Cons Of TPS For Venezuelans” February 27, 2019. https://immigrationreform.com/2019/02/27/the-pros-and-cons-of-tps-for-venezuelans/
16. Dan Cadman, 2019. (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad. Within the immigration law enforcement field, Mr. Cadman's knowledge and experience encompass, among other things, criminal aliens, employer sanctions, and national security and terrorism matters.) “TPS for Venezuela?” March 6, 2019. https://cis.org/Cadman/TPS-Venezuela
17. Dr. Kirk Johnson and Dr. Tim Kane, 2006. (Tim Kane, Ph.D., is Bradley Fellow in Labor Policy and Kirk A. Johnson, Ph.D., is a Senior Policy Analyst in the Center for Data Analysis at The Heritage Foundation.) “The Real Problem with Immigration... and the Real Solution” March 1, 2006. https://www.heritage.org/immigration/report/the-real-problem-immigration-and-the-real-solution
18. FAIR, 2016. (The Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR) is a non-profit tax exempt organization in the United States that self-identifies as an organization seeking to reduce both legal and illegal immigration.) “Temporary Protected Status” January 2016. http://fairus.org/issue/legal-immigration/temporary-protected-status
19. Prof. GEORGE J. BORJAS, 2016. (professor of economics and social policy at the Harvard Kennedy School of Govt.) “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers” September/October 2016. https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216
20. James Carafano, Steven Bucci, David Inserra, 2015. (Carafano - leading expert in national security and foreign policy challenges, The Heritage Foundation’s vice president for foreign and defense policy studies. Bucci - served America for three decades as an Army Special Forces officer and top Pentagon official, visiting research fellow at The Heritage Foundation. Inserra - specializes in cyber and homeland security policy, including protection of critical infrastructure, as policy analyst at Heritage Foundation.) 17 Nov 2015. “What a Responsible Syrian Refugee Policy Looks Like for US After Paris Attacks” http://dailysignal.com/2015/11/17/what-a-responsible-syrian-refugee-policy-looks-like-for-u-s-after-paris-attacks/
21. Alison Bodine 2018 (Coordinator of “Fire This Time Venezuela Solidarity Campaign”) 17 Oct 2018 “Why is the CBC Lying About Venezuela? Anna Maria Tremonti Manufactures Dissent” (brackets added) https://venezuelanalysis.com/analysis/14101